Tree Inventory Services, Request for Proposal #PUR1115-092

Proposal Evaluation Summary, January 14, 2016

Evaluators: Todd Fagan - Arborist/Landscape Architect, Daniel Gibbins – Parks Superintendent, and Sunny McDonald – GIS Data Analyst III

Ranking of Proposals

	Company Name	City , State	Price	Completion Date	Evaluation Points
1.	Arbor Pro, Inc.	Yorba Linda, CA	$189,000	10-15-16	1,000
2.	Davey Resource Group	Kent, OH	$ 219,000	08-20-16	900
3.	Community Forestry Consultants	Spokane, WA	$ 173,000	09-16-16	570
4.	Copper Tree Consulting	Pleasant Hill, IA	$ 316,400	10-31-16	530
5.	YTS	Rogers, MN	$445,005	12-31-16	100

1. Arbor Pro, Inc.
- Good experience and references
- Proposed an experienced team of 3 people and many municipal references
- Pricing includes up to 70,000 trees, stumps and planting sites
- If # of trees exceed 70,000, unit price is $3.15
- Software included in price
- "Community Viewer" would be a good tool
- Weekly exports and updates including a project status meeting

2. Davey Resource Group
- Offices located in Midwest, including Bettendorf, IA
- Proposed an experienced team of 4-8 people and many municipal references
- Pricing includes up to 70,000 trees, stumps and planting sites
- "Tree Keeper" software – can see the progress (updates) daily
- Proposed completion time was good
- Ranked lower than Arbor Pro due to proposed cost

3. Community Forestry Consultants
- Proposed Subconsultant – Kenerson Group (Athol, MA)
- Experience with Pacific NW trees
- Pricing includes up to 50,000 trees, stumps and planting sites
- If # of trees exceed 50,000, unit price is $3.46

4. Copper Tree Consulting

- Had the most local experience (all Arborists work and live in Iowa)
- Price is significantly higher than the next lowest bidder
- Proposal lacked detail compared to the top three
- Submittal instructions not adhered to (only 1 copy of proposal provided)
- Proposed price did not indicate a maximum number of trees

5. YTS
- Most of experience was with removal of Ash trees
- Proposed the longest timeline
- Proposal lacked substance
- Price high

Recommendation for Award

The evaluation team ranked the each proposal and Arbor Pro, Inc. was the highest rated with 1,000 points.